Case 1:16-cv-08215-WHP Document 56-23 Filed 03/19/18 Page 1 of 5

EXHIBIT 8

Case 1:16-cv-08215-WHP Document 56-23 Filed 03/19/18 Page 2 of 5

DHS Office of Intelligence & Analysis Vaughn Index Color of Change v. U.S. Department of Homeland Security, Civil Action No. 1:16-cv-08215 (S.D.N.Y.)

DHS Office of Intelligence and Analysis Freedom of Information Act Request No. 2017-IALI-00002 Date: January 9, 2018

A Doc.	<i>Doc.</i>	Bates	Status/Exemption	Justification/Description	Redaction
No.	Description	Nos.			Category
1	Email Analysis Titled "RE: Dallas TPs for General Taylor (***UPDA TE***)"	000253 - 000255	Withheld in Part (b)(3), (b)(5), (b)(6), (b)(7)(C), (b)(7)(E)	The withheld information is finished intelligence analysis relating to July 7, 2016 shooting incident involving Dallas, TX police officers, contained in the body of an email, produced by DHS/I&A as a member of the Intelligence Community (IC). Information withheld under (b)(3) consists of, or relates to, intelligence sources and methods that are protected from unauthorized disclosure under 6 U.S.C. § 121(d)(11) and 50 U.S.C. § 3024(i). The redacted information is exempt from disclosure pursuant to 6 U.S.C. § 121(d)(11) and 50 U.S.C. § 3024(i) as disclosure of this document would reveal intelligence sources and methods utilized by I&A. Specifically, it would reveal (1) the underlying sources of information and intelligence that I&A relied upon to form its analytical assessments and draft this intelligence product; (2) I&A's assessment of these sources, including I&A's determination of which publicly available sources are reputable; (3) intelligence and law enforcement information internal to I&A's IC partners; (4) the analytical insights of I&A and the IC into domestic terrorist actors and events; (5) I&A and the IC's analytical insights into domestic extremist groups; (6) assessments of particular extremist events and their outcomes; and (7) vulnerabilities and limits in intelligence methods based upon the IC's collection methods, allocation of resources, and focus of assessments that could be exploited by terrorist groups.	Statutorily Exempted Information;
				Information redacted under (b)(5) describes predecisional and deliberative internal discussions between DHS/I&A officials addressing drafting, negotiating, analytical, tradecraft, and writing issues in a draft product, as well as the draft product	Deliberative Process Privilege (Pre- Decisional);

Case 1:16-cv-08215-WHP Document 56-23 Filed 03/19/18 Page 3 of 5

DHS Office of Intelligence & Analysis Vaughn Index Color of Change v. U.S. Department of Homeland Security, Civil Action No. 1:16-cv-08215 (S.D.N.Y.)

DHS Office of Intelligence and Analysis Freedom of Information Act Request No. 2017-IALI-00002 Date: January 9, 2018

uary 9, 2018		itself. Releasing this information could chill candid discussions	
		between officials within the Department.	D (1
			Protected personal
		Information withheld under (b)(6) consists of contact and	information;
		personnel name information for DHS/I&A. The contact information is redacted because release would be a clearly	,
		unwarranted invasion of personal privacy. Release of such	
		information does not shed light on how DHS/I&A performs its	
		mission nor is there any public interest in the disclosure of such	
		information.	Law
			Enforcement
		Information redacted under $(b)(7)(C)$ describes and relates to a	Information; and
		public person of interest in a law enforcement investigation who	and
		was interviewed and released. Releasing this information would be an unwarranted invasion of the subject's personal privacy as	
		well as potentially harm law enforcement and national security	
		investigations.	T
			Law Enforcement
		The redacted information is also protected from release under	Information.
		exemption $(b)(7)(E)$, as release of this information would reveal	
		techniques, procedures, and guidelines for national security	
		investigations and prosecutions and could reasonably be expected to risk circumvention of the law. This includes information on (1)	
		the indicators that an individual may be radicalizing to domestic	
		extremism; (2) particular subjects of interest for domestic	
		extremism; (3) the presence or non-presence of connections to	
		international terrorism; (4) the process through which I&A and	
		the IC assess sources, threats, radicalization, and indicators; and	
		(5) procedures or guidelines for collaboration and coordination	
		across the U.S. Government. Release of this information would	
		enable domestic extremist actors to exploit the information in	

Case 1:16-cv-08215-WHP Document 56-23 Filed 03/19/18 Page 4 of 5

DHS Office of Intelligence & Analysis Vaughn Index Color of Change v. U.S. Department of Homeland Security, Civil Action No. 1:16-cv-08215 (S.D.N.Y.)

DHS Office of Intelligence and Analysis Freedom of Information Act Request No. 2017-IALI-00002 Date: January 9, 2018

				order to avoid detection by I&A and the IC and interfere with I&A's intelligence collection, thereby endangering U.S. national security.	
2	Email Analysis Titled "RE: (U//LES) Race Paper for First	000265	Withheld in Part (b)(5), (b)(6)	Information redacted under (b)(5) describes predecisional and deliberative internal discussions between DHS/I&A officials addressing drafting, analytical, tradecraft, and writing issues in a draft product. Releasing this information could chill candid discussions between officials within the Department.	Deliberative Process Privilege (Pre- Decisional); and
	Level Review"			Information withheld under (b)(6) consists of contact and personnel name information for DHS/I&A. The contact information is redacted because release would be a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy. Release of such information does not shed light on how DHS/I&A performs its mission nor is there any public interest in the disclosure of such information.	Protected Personal Information.
3	Draft Intelligence Assessment Referred to in Emails as a Version of a "Race Paper"	000508 - 000516 (draft one) 000524 - 000532 (draft two) 000533 - 000539 (draft three)	Withheld in Full (b)(3), (b)(5)	The withheld information is part of a finished intelligence product that was never finalized or disseminated outside of DHS/I&A. The document contains evaluated intelligence information produced by DHS/I&A as a member of the IC. Information withheld under (b)(3) consists of, or relates to, intelligence sources and methods that are protected from unauthorized disclosure under 6 U.S.C. § 121(d)(11) and 50 U.S.C. § 3024(i). The redacted information is exempt from disclosure pursuant to 6 U.S.C. § 121(d)(11) and 50 U.S.C. § 3024(i) as disclosure of this document would reveal intelligence sources and methods utilized by I&A. Specifically, it would reveal (1) the underlying sources of information and intelligence that I&A relied upon to form its analytical assessments and draft this intelligence product, including the identities of confidential sources of information; (2) I&A's assessment of these sources, including I&A's	Statutorily Exempted Information; and

Case 1:16-cv-08215-WHP Document 56-23 Filed 03/19/18 Page 5 of 5

DHS Office of Intelligence & Analysis Vaughn Index Color of Change v. U.S. Department of Homeland Security, Civil Action No. 1:16-cv-08215 (S.D.N.Y.)

DHS Office of Intelligence and Analysis Freedom of Information Act Request No. 2017-IALI-00002 Date: January 9, 2018

Date: January 9, 2018	000540		
	000540 -	determination of which publicly available sources are reputable;	
	000548	(3) the non-attributable methods by which I&A collected	
	(draft	departmental and national intelligence for the Department and IC	
	four)	from publicly available sources; (4) I&A's core analytical	
		judgments regarding the scope, reach, and effectiveness of	
	000549 -	domestic terrorism threats; (5) I&A's evaluation of the tactics,	
	000554	techniques, and procedures used by domestic terrorist actors; (6)	
	(draft	the subjects and targets of interest to I&A, the Department, and	
	five)	the intelligence community; (7) recommended mitigation	
		strategies to counter domestic terrorism; (8) the confidence-level	
	000555 -	of I&A's analytical assessments and methods of self and peer	
	000565	assessment of analytical intelligence products; and (9)	
	(draft six)	vulnerabilities in intelligence methods based upon I&A and the	
		IC's collection methods, allocation of resources, and focus of	
	000566 -	assessments that could be exploited by terrorist actors.	
	000577	1 5	
	(draft	Information redacted under (b)(5) is predecisional and	Deliberative
	seven)	deliberative internal information shared between DHS/I&A	Process
		officials addressing drafting, analytical, tradecraft, and writing	Privilege (Pre-
		issues in a draft intelligence product., to include in-line edits and	Decisional).
		comments, as well as incremental revisions that reflect the	
		deliberative process. Releasing this information and exposing the	
		process could chill candid discussions between officials within	
		the Department and interfere with the development of intelligence	
		analysis and policy. Release could also create public confusion by	
		disclosing intelligence rationales and analysis that may were not	
		ultimately adopted in a final product.	
		unimatery adopted in a final product.	